

Subject: Minutes of 86th meeting of India CCM

Date	28.10.2022
Venue of the Meeting	155-A, Nirman Bhawan 1st Floor Committee Room, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi
Meeting started	5:00 PM
Meeting adjourned	7:00 PM
Meeting Chaired by	Sh. Rajesh Bhushan, Secretary (Health)/Chair India CCM
Total Number of Participants	35
Did the meeting attained quorum	Yes
Did the meeting have any conflict of interest	No, Adequate measures to mitigate Conflict of Interest were taken during the meeting.
Meeting attendance	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Country Coordinating Mechanism (CCM) Member: 13 (Physically Present: 03) and Virtually Present : 10)▪ Alternate member: 07 (Physically Present: 0 and Virtually Present: 07)▪ Special Invitees: 11 (Physically Present: 03 and Virtually Present: 08) Country Coordinating Mechanism Secretariat: 4 (Physically Present: 4)
Attendance list	Yes Annexure-I

86th meeting of India CCM was conducted on 28th October 2022 at 5:00 PM under the Chairmanship of Sh. Rajesh Bhushan, Secretary (HFW)/Chair India CCM in Room No. 155-A, Nirman Bhawan.

Translation of key discussion points and decisions was provided in Hindi for the benefit of the civil society, community and persons living with disease constituency members.

Agenda Item No. 1: Endorsement of minutes of 85th India CCM meeting.

It was informed by Dr Shobini Rajan – Focal point (India CCM) that there were no inputs received upon circulating the minutes right after the 85th meeting or again prior to 86th meeting. The minutes were unanimously ratified by India CCM. (Final minutes enclosed at [Annexure II](#))

Agenda Item No. 2: Update on Reconstitution of India CCM for term 2022-2025 (detailed PPT enclosed at [Annexure III](#))

A detailed presentation on the Reconstitution of India CCM for the term 2022-25 was made by Focal point (India CCM) based on the EoI for reconstitution of India CCM issued on 14th July 2022, Report of the Election Committee received by ICCM secretariat on 17th October 2022 and addendum to the report received on 27th October 2022 and minutes of the two meetings of Selection Committee for Private and Academic constituencies held on 19th September 2022 and 12th October 2022.

For communities and civil society membership:

By way of background, it was informed that the Election Committee was set up under chairpersonship of David Bridger, Country Director UNAIDS, comprising of members Ms Sujatha Rao, Ex Secy HFW Gol and Father Paul Mooljely, Director CARITAS, that was engaged for recommending civil society and community members and alternate members totalling 20 across HIV/ TB/ malaria constituencies for CSO, KP and PLWD categories. The key activities are given below for record.

- Process for reconstitution of the ICCM for 2022-25, was approved in the 83rd meeting of the I CCM

- Election Committee was constituted as per approval of the Chair, India CCM on February 21, 2022
- First Meeting of EC on May 23, 2022 to concur on a common understanding on the the process of reconstitution with regards to the various categories of stakeholders and set specific timelines for completing the reconstitution process
- The draft Eol was shared with the current ICCM members on June 7, 2022 to gather their feedback
- Eol published on July 14, 22 with the deadline of July 31, 2022 for submission of application
- On the request by applicants who were keen to apply, but were attending the International AIDS Conference, the last date of submission was extended to August 15, 2022 through email consensus from the EC members on July 28, 2022
- Initial list was shared with the EC committee on August 16, 2022 and the EC recommended to
 - Examine the credentials of applicants
 - Authenticity of the application
 - Revert back to applicants to seek further clarity
- Meeting on August 18, 2022 to discuss next steps with regards to the Eol application process and the EC recommended to
 - Examine each application in detail to identify the supporting information that may be required to consider the application
 - Share the initial collation of details of applications by August 24, 2022 with the EC
 - Send mail to the applicants by Aug 25, 2022 seeking details with a deadline of August 29, 12 pm
 - Applications that are received upto August 29, 2022 will be examined for final short listing and further consideration by the EC
- Progress shared on Aug 23, 2022 with the India CCM during the 85th meeting where Chair EC, Mr David Bridger presented the process, detailed progress and the timeline for finalization of the EC report.
- Mails sent to all applicants with a deadline of 12, pm, August 29, 2022, to provide the necessary details for consideration of their nomination by the EC on August 30, 2022. With consensus of the EC Members, all applications received till 9 am, August 30, 2022, were considered
- A physical meeting of EC was convened on August 30, 2022 meeting with the objectives to
 - To review the suitability of the nominees to be part of the CCM
 - To shortlist the candidates as per the available seats under each constituency as per disease category
 - To recommend the next steps for the finalization of the selection process
- The EC finalized the names for the HIV and TB disease category, but only 1 name was recommended under the CSO category for Malaria as the other applications did not meet the qualifying criteria. EC recommended
 - Reissuing the Eol for the Malaria constituency and also to reach out to NVBDPCP to circulate the Eol and also recommend suitable names
- Eol reissued on Sept 8, 2022 with a deadline of Sept 18, 2022 for Malaria category
- EC meeting was held on 21st September 2022 to review and finalise applications for the Malaria category.
- The final report was submitted on the 17th October 2022.
- After submission of the full report by the EC, containing recommendations for 18 out of 20 positions of member and alternate for HIV, TB and Malaria disease constituencies across CSO, KP and PWLD, a representation was received vide email sent to all members of ICCM that was forwarded by India CCM Secretariat to the EC chair and members for inputs and response. The complaint was received from NCPI +, a PLHIV network vide email dated October 19, 2022 alleging “unclear and unfair” process of selection against the PLWD HIV constituency, that was seconded by the Vice Chair of ICCM vide her email message dated October, 20, 2022.
- The EC shared an addendum to the final report by the EC on 17th October 2022 in which they have reiterated their stance on the final recommendations to say that the process was inclusive, transparent and there was no unfairness in recommendations.

The nominations against each of the constituencies were read out and it was also informed that the aforementioned reconstitution process was followed on similar lines to the previous one in 2018, and as

laid out in the EoI with no deviations and that no representations were received during the entire period from constitution of EC to its submission of final report.

The key recommendations of EC were:

1. 18 nominations were selected by EC for inclusion in ICCM as members and alternates to be taken up in the ICCM for approval and notification
2. Continue the process for identification of suitable candidates against alternate member for PLWD and KP in malaria through a detailed search for 3 months and complete it at the earliest
3. 4 candidate panel was recommended by EC to fill the two vacant positions of ICCM in case the positions of malaria are not filled through the extended search.
4. Joint efforts of ICCM Secretariat, UNAIDS and Programme divisions to strengthen the communities and civil societies under Malaria to enable their future inclusion in the ICCM
5. Overall capacity building of newly included ICCM members and alternates
6. Consideration of structural reallocations of the seats for HIV, TB and Malaria for future as unlike TB and HIV, Malaria constituency probably does not identify themselves under these categories of KP and PLWD

The chairperson ICCM opened the forum for discussions that are summarized below:

1. Mr Pratik Rawal, Member ICCM representing PLWD HIV informed of the view of the PLHIV community that they were not satisfied by the process followed by EC especially for PLWD HIV seats and felt that the process was only that of “selection” and not of “election”. He informed that elections were done for PLWD HIV in the last round of reconstitution.
2. Ms Shyamala Nataraj, Vice Chair ICCM said that wherever there are more than one nominations, there should be a process of election to identify the most suitable candidate with full community participation.
3. Member Secretary ICCM sought a response as to why the issue is being raised at this stage, and not earlier, as the process followed by the EC allowed for intervention at all stages, especially when the process was presented in the 85th meeting of ICCM in August 2022 and minutes circulated thereof.
4. Mr Siddheshwar, Member ICCM representing CSO TB seconded that elections should have been conducted for TB constituency as well.
5. The chairperson sought the view of the EC representatives in the meeting. Since Mr David Bridger was out of country, Ms Nandini Kapoor Dhingra, Alternate member ICCM and Father Paul Moojely, Member Malaria CSO gave their views.
 - a. Ms Dhingra said that the process was similar to the last time in 2018, but in the last round, there were two requests received by EC at UNAIDS/ ICCM Secretariat from two of the HIV constituencies requesting to support their election process. Hence with financial assistance from ICCM secretariat, two physical meetings were held for FSW and PLHIV constituencies, where Election Committee members were present. It was however indicated that the same was done on express request of the community and the EC did not conduct the process of Elections, which was coordinated by the community themselves. The names that came through this process were also included for the final selection process in addition to the names received through EoI. She indicated that this time no such request was received and in case it had been, needful would have been done. She also informed that all members that for HIV, all recommended candidates had been backed by their respective networks and no candidate who is self nominated has been recommended by the EC for inclusion in ICCM.
 - b. Father Paul succinctly indicated his faith in the fairness and thoroughness with which the process and proceedings of Election Committee were conducted and that he was fully satisfied with the recommendations.
6. Mr Pratik Rawal reiterated his dissatisfaction with the two names recommended for PLWD HIV and that they were not the elected members from community, but selected by the EC and hence are not acceptable.
7. Chairperson sought views from the remaining HIV and TB and Malaria communities, as to whether they had any objections to accepting the recommendations of EC with respect to their constituencies and categories.
8. Considering that the recommendations were acceptable to the large majority of the constituencies that they were meant for, the Chairperson proposed that we may perhaps keep the seats for PLWD

- HIV vacant due to the dissatisfaction expressed with the process and refer it back to Election Committee.
9. EC representative from UNAIDS accepted and agreed that it was possible for EC to accommodate this request of PLWD HIV community.
10. Member Secretary, also representing the views of AS&DG NACO expressed deep disappointment that due to lack of timely response from the PLWD HIV community during the process of reconstitution of ICCM for the next three years, that is now necessitating referring the matter back to EC, there would be a phase of not having PLHIV representation in the ICCM, which is very disheartening for the HIV programme.

Decision point:

- Since there was no objection from any of the CCM members regarding the recommendation for inclusion of 16 out of 18 members recommended by Election Committee, the reconstitution of ICCM with these 16 members and alternates replacing the existing members and alternates was **Endorsed**.
- Two seats of PLWD HIV would remain vacant till such time as the Election Committee shares alternate recommendations for the position of member and alternate for PLWD HIV.
- An intensified search be undertaken for filling up two seats of Alternates for PLWD and KP in Malaria to be able to fill these in the coming three months.

For Academic and Private Sector membership:

By way of background, it was informed that the Selection Committee was set up under chairpersonship of DR Udayabhanu Das, DDG NACO, Dr Raghuram Rao, ADG CTD and Dr Vinod Choudhary, Medical Officer NCVBDC that was engaged for recommending Academic and Private Sector members and alternate members totalling 8. The key activities are given below for record.

- EoI published on July 14, 22 with the deadline of July 31, 2022 for submission of application
- This was further extended till 15th August 2022.
- In light of non availability of suitable candidature, the EoI were recirculated with various private and academic institutions of repute as well as with the three programme divisions for wider circulation as recommended by the Selection Committee in meeting held on 19th September 2022.
- Nominations were invited till 10th October 2022.
- 12 nominations received were reviewed by the Selection Committee in the meeting held on 12th October 2022 as per criteria laid out in the EoI and three members and three alternates were recommended for reconstitution of ICCM.
- The membership of ICMR with the Secretary as Member and Head ECD as Alternate was retained as such.

The nominations against each of the constituencies were read out and were unanimously agreed by full ICCM.

Decision point:

- Since there was agreement by CCM members regarding the recommendation for 8 members and alternates for private and academic sector constituencies, the reconstitution of ICCM with these 8 members and alternates replacing the existing members and alternates was **Endorsed**.

Agenda Item No. 3: Extension of term of present Oversight Committee of India CCM term till December 2023. (detailed PPT enclosed at **Annexure IV**)

Focal Point, India CCM apprised the CCM that the usual tenure of the Oversight Committee of India CCM is for two years. She informed that the process of selection members of the present Oversight Committee through EoI was begun in September 2020 and the decision for the present composition was taken in November 2020. The kick off meeting however took place in April 2021. She further informed that due to

the COVID 19 situation in the country, frequent oversight visits could not take place and that the tenure of the present OC comes to an end on 31st December 2022.

The proposal to extend the tenure of the existing OC by a period of one year till December 2023 in the same lines as extension of India CCM was sought in November 2021 was put forth before the CCM for their consideration.

Decision point:

- Since there was no objection from any of the CCM members regarding the extension of the present Oversight Committee in the lines of extension given to India CCM, the decision point was considered **Endorsed**.
- The tenure of the Oversight Committee of India CCM as per extant constitution is extended till 31st December 2023.

Agenda Item No. 4: CCM Evolution (detailed PPT enclosed at *Annexure V*)

Focal Point, India CCM appraised the CCM regarding the concept of CCM Evolution which is a global activity managed by CCM Hub of The Global Fund for all CCMs in order to assess the functionality of the CCMs and to be able to come up with recommendations to strengthen the CCMs. The three key phases of Evolution being: a) Threshold b) Interventions and c) 2nd Threshold.

She further appraised that a virtual meeting was convened regarding CCM Evolution- India by India CCM secretariat with the CCM Hub and global consultant engaged for this purpose on 19th September 2022. While full CCM was invited for the same sans Chair and Member Secretary, it was attended by only **8 ICCM members/ alternates**. It was also informed that **the CCM Evolution 360 Survey** has been repeatedly shared with the entire CCM as well as all programme divisions and stakeholders, however the total responses received till date is only **21**.

She appraised that in order to facilitate the Evolution process, the CCM is asked to form a 7-8 member CCM Evolution Task Force (or appoint an existing group or committee to play this role) prior to the start of the Threshold & Induction assignment, as detailed in the Task Force Terms of Reference.

In view that the activity (threshold) has to be completed within 2022, it was proposed that

- a) The survey is recirculated to all ICCM members to fill by due date of 31st October 2022.
- b) The process is initiated by requesting the existing Oversight Committee to additionally perform the activity of the Evolution Task Force. The whole process would last for a period of 15 days to a maximum of one month.

Chair, India CCM put across the proposal and sought for views of the Chairperson and Co chairperson of Oversight Committee, who agreed to take up the task subject to a detailed meeting to understand the scope and to set reasonable timelines.

Decision points:

- Chair, India CCM asked that the 360 Threshold Survey be recirculated among the entire CCM so that those who have not completed the survey may complete the same.
- The members of the existing Oversight Committee can take up the function of Evolution Task Force as per the ToRs of the Task Force. Any other members of ICCM desirous of participating in the exercise may be co-opted if necessary.
- Chair, India CCM further suggested that a briefing session can be organized to discuss in detail about the CCM Evolution Task Force and if everyone is comfortable with the timelines suggested, can proceed further.

Agenda 5: Concluding remarks of outgoing members of ICCM

With the permission of chair, Sh Alok Saxena, Member Secretary, India CCM, on behalf of Chair, India

CCM and the three Programme Divisions, extended his thanks to all present India CCM members for their immense contribution for the last four years. He made the concluding remarks as the outgoing Member Secretary of the ICCM, since this would be his last meeting prior to his superannuation in the month of October 2022.

He reiterated that extended tenure of the present CCM comes to a close with effect from 31st October 2022 and that from 1st November 2022, a new CCM (as proposed) will be in place with the exception of HIV-PLWD Constituency and the two vacant seats of Malaria.

Vice Chair, Dr. Shyamala Nataraj, as the outgoing civil society representative and Vice chairperson of the ICCM expressed heartfelt thanks to the Chairperson ICCM, the CSO, KP, and PLWD members of HIV, Malaria and TB Constituencies. She also extended her sincere thanks to all other members of India CCM, Member Secretary, Focal Point, India CCM and to India CCM Secretariat and wished the very best to ICCM for its future endeavours.

Sh. Rajesh Bhushan, Chair India CCM thanked the Vice Chair, Member Secretary and all the CCM Members for all their time and significant contributions to this meeting and the entire tenure of the present constitution.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair!

Annexure-I

CCM Member

Sl.No.	Name of Participants	Designation/Organisation	Physically Attended
1	Sh.Rajesh Bhushan	Secretary (HFW)/Chair, ICCM	Y
2	Sh. Alok Saxena	AS&DG, MoHFW/Member Secy, ICCM	Y
3	Sh.Jaideep Mishra	AS&FA, MoHFW/CCM Member	Y
			Virtually Attended
4	Ms.Aparna Upadhyay	MD (NHM), UP/CCM Member	Y
5	Sh.Rai Mahimapat Ray	Deputy Secretary (IMF)/CCM Member	Y
6	Dr.P.Senthil Kumar	PRL Secretary (TN)/CCM Member	Y
7	Dr.Shyamala Nataraj	Executive Director, SIAAP/Vice Chair, ICCM	Y
8	Mr.Shridhar Pandey	Secy.&Chief, GBJS/CCM Member	Y
9	Fr.Paul Moonjely	Executive Director, Caritas/CCM Member	Y
10	Mr.Pratik Raval	Asstt.Director,GIPA/ Member, ICCM	Y
11	Mr.Sudeshwar Singh	Secretary, TB Mukta Vahini/Member ICCM	Y
12	Dr.R.V.Asokan	Hon.Secretary General, IMA/CCM Member	Y
13	Dr.Rodrigo Ofrin	WR, India/CCM Member	Y

Alternate Member

Sl.No.	Name of Participants	Designation/Organisation	Virtually Attended
1	Tmt Shilpa Prabakar Satheesh	MD(NHM), TN/Alt.CCM Member	Y
2	Sh.Rajeev Sridhar	Under Secretay (FB)/Alt.CCM Member	Y
3	Dr.Ranjani Ramachandran	NPO Labs, WHO/Alt.CCM Member	Y
4	Mr.Hashmat Rabbani	Secretary, Gramin Samaj Kalyan Vikas Manch/Alt.Member,ICCM	Y
5	Dr.Raghavan Gopa Kumar	Founder Member, Touched by TB/Alt.CCM Member	Y
6	Ms.Nandini Kapoor Dhingra	Senior Technical Adviser, UNAIDS/Alt.Member, ICCM	Y
7	Ms.Melissa Nyendak	Director-CDC, Global Health/Alt.CCM Member	Y

Special Invitees

Sl.No.	Name of Participants	Designation/Organisation	Physically Attended
1	Ms. V.Hekali Zhimomi	Additional Secretary, MoHFW	Y
2	Dr.P.Ashok Babu	JS, MoHFW	Y
3	Ms. Nidhi Kesarwani	Director, (NACO), MoHFW	Y
			Virtually Attended
4	Dr.R.P.Joshi	DDG (TB), MoHFW	Y
5	Dr.Raghuram Rao	Joint Director, CTD, MoHFW	Y
6	D.Bhawani Singh	DD (NACO), MoHFW	Y
7	Dr.Vinod Chaudhary	Medical Officer, (NCVBDC), MoHFW	Y
8	Dr.B.L.Parihar	Manager (M&E),NACO	Y
9	Mr.Gaurav Gupta	LFA, PWC	Y
10	Ms.Aastha	Coordinator, C-II	Y
11	Ms.Aakangshita Dutta	Coordinator, C-II	Y

India CCM Secretariat

Sl.No.	Name of Participants	Designation/Organisation	Physically Attended
1	Dr.Shobini Rajan	DDG/Focal Point, ICCM	Y
2	Ms.Gitanjali Mohanty	Coordinator, ICCM	Y
3	Ms.Veena Kumra	P.O., ICCM	Y
4	Ms.Veena Chauhan	Admn.Asstt., ICCM	Y

It may be noted that out of 26 Members of India CCM, 13 Members attended the meeting (both physically and virtually and 13 Members did not attend the meeting (neither physically nor virtually) and out of 24 Alternate Members of India CCM, 7 Alternate Members attended the meeting (both physically and virtually and 17 Members did not attend the meeting (neither physically nor virtually)