

RECONSTITUTION OF INDIA
COUNTRYCOORDINATING MECHANISM
2022-2025

Final Meeting December 22, 22

India CCM Reconstitution Report
Short listing and selection of candidates for 4 seats for civil society and communities in ICCM for 2022-25

Background

The India Country Coordinating Mechanism (I-CCM) is in the process of being reconstituted for the period of 2022 to 2025. An Election Committee (EC) that has been established with the membership as listed below has been overseeing the process:

1. Mr. David Bridger, UNAIDS Country Director, - Chairperson EC
2. Ms. Sujatha Rao, Ex-Secretary Health, MOHFW- member
3. Father Paul Mooly, Executive Director, CARITAS- member

Progress till date

The first Expression of Interest (Eoi) was issued on July 2022 and circulated it widely for the CSO/KP/PLWD seats for HIV/TB Malaria. Post the deadline on August 15, 2022, the nominations was reviewed by the EC on August 30, 2022 and assessed on the basis of criteria established by the CCM. Post the meeting the EC recommended 15 seats as listed below:

- 6 for TB – 2 under each CSO/KP and PLWD category
- 8 for HIV 2 under CSO, 4 under KP and 2 under PLHIV and
- 1 under Malaria CSO as the other applications did not meet the eligibility criteria.

Due to inadequate applications under the Malaria disease category, the Eoi was further reissued seeking applications for the 5 seats based on the EC recommendation and CCM concurrence in September, 2022. The EC convened on September 21, 2022, post reviewing the applications recommended 18 nominations for inclusion in ICCM. The EC recommendations were presented at the 86th CCM meeting held on 28th October 2022. Post deliberation the CCM accepted 16 nominations of the 18 recommended by the EC and recommended that the Eoi be reissued again to complete the quorum of the CCM.

Post this the Eoi was reissued on November 21, for two seats for Malaria-(1 for PLWD/1 for KP) and 2 for HIV/PLHIV (1 member and 1 alternate) responding to the submission made by the HIV PLHIV community.

Post the closing date of December 15, the Secretariat examined the applications to assess the information and supporting documents provided by the applicants, as per the eligibility criteria listed in the Eoi. All applications were assessed on the basis of the eligibility criteria as listed below:

Eligibility Criteria	Scoring
Not be a Principal or Sub Recipient of Global Fund grants or be working for any PR/SR with active grant in India	15
Demonstrated existing engagement with either one or all three areas of HIV/AIDS, TB, Malaria for at least 5 years	25
Demonstrate their capacity to represent the CSO/KP/PLWD constituency in India CCM	25
Ability to engage community members by establishing communication channels between community and CCM	25

Be willing to sign a Conflict of Interest Declaration of India-CCM	10
Total Score	100

Besides the above criteria, since the HIV/PLHIV positions had been reissued due to the submission by community members, therefore these applications were assessed on the basis of the documentation furnished by the candidates to support their election/ selection by the organization(s) consisting of members from the respective community and the endorsement letters provided by these organizations/networks.

December 22, 2022

The EC reconvened virtually on December 22, 2022 with the objective to

- To review the suitability of the applicants to be part of the CCM
- To shortlist the candidates as per the available seats under the constituency as per disease category

The Committee deliberated on the candidature of each applicant to assess his/her/their suitability for the position applied for as per specific areas given below:

- Work experience in the selected disease area for at least 5 years
- Ability to represent their constituency
- Ability to engage their community from within their selected constituency

The Election Committee also considered names whose applications had all these documentary evidence attached, besides meeting the eligibility criteria as detailed in the EoI. It was agreed that if more than one nomination is received by the India CCM, the recommendation for the final candidates will be made by the Election Committee to the CCM based on the completeness of the application and criteria as shared in the EOI. During the meeting, the list of 9 applications (listed below), were assessed to finalize the selection and recommendation.

No	Disease	Constituency	Name	Organisation
TOTAL LIST OF CANDIDATES				
1.	HIV/AIDS	PLWD	Ms Anandi Yuvraj	Independent, Nominated by NCPI plus, PWN
2.	HIV/AIDS	PLWD	Raval Pratik Anantray	Assistant Director, GIPA Gujrat SACS , Nominated by NCPI plus, PWN
3.	HIV/AIDS	PWID	Hari Singh	National Representative, Global Alliance for Human Rights (GAHR), Nominated by GAHR
4.	HIV/AIDS	PLWD	Celina D'Costa	National representative women wing for Global Alliance for Human Rights (GAHR) and Advisor and Program Lead, Women and HIV at Human Touch Foundation Goa.. Nominated by GAHR
5.	HIV/AIDS	KP	Mr Abou Mere	Indian Drug Users Forum (IDUF)
Malaria				
6.	Malaria	KP	Dr K Ravi Kumar	Independent Vector Borne Diseases, Self Nominated
7.	Malaria	PLWD/KP	Poornima Kandhari	Supervisor, Nirvana Foundation, Nominated by her organization Nirvana Foundation
8.	Malaria	PLWD	Shubhangi Chandrashekhar Kharate	Supervisor, Pride India , Nominated by her organization, Pride India
9.	Malaria	KP	Imam Ansari	Chief Functionary and Secretary, Lok Jagriti Kendra, Lohardaga, Jharkhand. Self Nominated

Summary of Discussion

The final selection in this round was also based on the same guiding principles as in the earlier rounds of selection. Some of the salient points are listed below for reference:

The guiding principles adopted by the EC while selecting candidates against vacancies were the following:

1. The final selection was based on the individual merit and scoring, while ensuring a balance of representation from all constituencies, besides focusing on geographical distribution and gender balance.

2. ICCM norms allow for continuation of an individual as a member/ alternate for a maximum of two terms (usually 6 years). Hence, the applications from existing members/ alternate members for continuation for a further term were considered favorably, subject to their active engagement in the ICCM meetings in the present term.

4. The conflict of interest was scored based on self-declaration and in the case of members who had nominated themselves under the PLWD/KP category, in future if they join PR/SR organisations or become office bearers of such organizations their candidature will be considered disqualified.

5. Wherever there is discontinuation by any member/alternate under the PLWD/KP category, and the seat falls vacant, such positions will be re-advertised for open nomination instead of nomination by the outgoing member/his affiliated constituency or organization.

6. Wherever, the EC was of the opinion regarding suitability and fit of candidature for a different constituency/ category than applied for, selection has been done on this basis.

7. For the case of Malaria, despite extension of date of EOI and its wider circulation, candidates who had applied for two of the positions (Alternates for KP and PLWD categories) were still unable to meet the criteria of community representation and nomination, despite applying as KP and PLWD. Post discussion, the EC was of the opinion that to examine the candidates from the perspective of in depth knowledge and work experience in the area of Malaria as that would add value to the CCM.

HIV/AIDS

The EC considered the applications for 2 place holder under this category – 1 for PLHIV Primary and the other for PLHIV Alternate. The individual scoring sheets for all for all eligible candidates and those candidates who could not be accommodated is attached as annexures:

The selection is detailed below:

PLWD Primary	PLWD Alternate
Ms Anandi Yuvraj	Ms Celina D' Costa

Ms Anandi Yuvraj

Ms Yuvraj was one of the earliest HIV positive women who opened up on her status in 1998 and has been working on HIV/AIDS issues for more than 2 decades. She has extensive experience and understanding of the issues and challenges in the area of HIV/AIDS including strategy, policy and programme management, governance and accountability. She has worked with several national and international organization including HIV/AIDS Alliance and UNAIDS. In the recent context she has worked on issues such as gender, SRHR issues, stigma and discrimination in the context of HIV positive women.

Since the last couple of years, Anandi has been working as a Member of the WHO committee which was constituted to revise WHO guidelines on Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights (SRHR) for women living with HIV. She also advocated for the implementation of the SRHR guidelines at national level and supported the pilot whereby the guidelines were introduced in 3 states (2021-22) in India. Ms Yuvraj was also part of NACO's HIV strategic planning processes and has also served as the NCO's Technical Resource Group (TRG) on Stigma and Discrimination and contributed to the development of the

National Guidelines/Handbook on stigma and discrimination. Anandi has also been contributing to the visioning exercise processes as community expert on advocacy and policy for PLHIVs supported by National Coalition of People Living with HIV (NCPI+).

In terms of his eligibility Ms Yuvraj was scored on all accounts by the EC. Anandi successfully demonstrated her knowledge of the programme, policy and implementation and familiarity with PLHIV issues and challenges, especially in the context of women PLHIV. She was also rated highest in terms of her ability to represent and engage community as she was elected through an open and transparent process by two large PLHIV networks – the National Coalition of People living with HIV (NCPI+) and the Positive Women’s Network (PWN+). Her nomination was also supported by several State and District positive network. The EC also considered her neutral stand, her unilateral support from the community and vast experience and strongly recommended her inclusion within the India CCM.

Ms Celina D’Costa

Ms Celina is an HIV activist with over 27 years of experience in the field of HIV, and has been working with local and National PLHIV Networks, INGOs and NGOs as an advocate for the rights of PLHIV especially women and children. Currently Celina is the national representative women wing for Global Alliance for Human Rights (GAHR) and also an advisor and Program Lead, Women and HIV at Human Touch Foundation Goa. She represents causes for women and children at various forums both at national and global level. She was also part of the Indian Network of Positive People (INP+) since 1998 and also has held the position of Vice President for the period 2007-9. Celina has worked with the PLHIV community and promises to bring their perspectives and needs to the table at the India CCM.

In terms of eligibility, Celina scored in terms of her work experience, ability to represent and engage her community and her knowledge and awareness on issues of PLHIV women and children. She has been nominated by the GAHR network, who has submitted both the documentation of her selection and the endorsement by many other state and district PLHIV networks including GAHR.

Please note:

In the initial round Celina had been nominated by GAHR and had been recommended as a primary PLWD member under the HIV/AIDS category. However in this round of applications Ms Anandi Yuvraj’s candidature was given higher weight age in terms of her work experience, found to be stronger in terms of work experience, knowledge about issues in terms of programme and policy and her support by two large positive network in India. Therefore the EC recommended Celina as an alternate PLWD member and Anandi as the primary member in the CCM

Candidates who could not qualify

Mr Pratik Anantray Raval, an existing PLWD member in the outgoing ICCM could not be accommodated in the current session as he scored lower than the selected candidates in terms of his work experience and ability to engage and represent the issues of his constituency at the CCM. The EC members observed that since he was already there for a term, it would may be better to get more fresh perspective from individuals who have broader perspectives on the issues of PLHIV and were more suited to cover the ambit.

Mr Hari Singh, had earlier applied as a PLWD representative under the TB category and this time round his nomination was proposed in the HIV/AIDS category. Mr Singh scored much lower than the other 3 candidates whose credentials were much stronger. Thus he could not be recommended for inclusion within the CCM.

Candidate on Standby

Abou Mere: The final candidate in the HIV disease category was of Mr Abou Mere who had applied in the KP category. under the HIV/AIDS category. Mr **Abou** represents the Indian Drug Users Forum, and was one of the earliest applicant when the EoI had been issued in August 2022. However when he did not see any reference about him in the initial report released by the India CCM in October, 2022, he got in touch with the Secretariat and was informed that no application was received from him. Further examination in the matter revealed that the application may not have been receive due to a technical glitch which had been addressed post a few days after the advertisement. He then decided to resubmit it in this round.

IDUF is a network strengthening the capacity of IDUs for prevention, adherence to care and treatment by initiating and strengthening community networks at state and district level.

Post the background, the EC agreed to park his name as a contingency, based on the strong credential of the candidate, to be accommodated in case there is a drop out in the KP category during the current term of the CCM. The EC advised that a letter be drafted to this intent and shared with Mr Abou Mere and also explain to him that since the CCM has already accepted the proposed names under the KP category, it may not be feasible to consider the same at the moment.

Malaria

The EC considered the applications for 2 place holder under this category – 1 for KP and 1 for PLWD, under the alternate category as the primary positions had been finalized in the earlier round. On December 22, the EC was presented the applications for consideration of which 2 were for KP, 1 for PLWD and 1 had not clarified the constituency in the application. Post reviews the EC shortlisted 2 of the 4 applications.

The individual scoring sheets for all for all eligible candidates and those candidates who could not be accommodated is attached as annexures:

The selection is detailed below:

PLWD Alternate	KP Alternate
Poonam Kandari	Dr K Ravi Kumar

Dr K Ravi Kumar – KP, Malaria

Mr Kumar had nominated himself under the KP constituency. He is a retired Senior Regional Director, Ministry of Health and FW, with 39 years of experience across health verticals and with primary focus on Vector Borne Disease including Malaria. Since his retirement in March 2022, Dr Kumar has been associated with the NCVBDC as an independent consultant to support the development of the India National Strategic Plan for Malaria elimination as a lead expert working on behalf of WHO Country Office India, besides being part of the review mission for Lymphatic Filariasis. Dr Kumar has also worked with various organizations including WHO, DFID and others in the area of Malaria. He has indepth knowledge and experience in programme policy, strategy and implementation. He is familiar with the issues and challenges and also has extensive field experience at the grass root level. He is also familiar with all stakeholders engaged in the Malaria Programme.

In terms of his eligibility Dr Kumar scored in terms of his existing engagement in the area of Malaria and other vector borne diseases for more than 25 years in terms of programmes, policy and implementation besides his familiarity with issues and challenges in the area of Malaria. In the analysis by the EC members, Dr Ravi however was found wanting in terms of his ability to represent and engage community. However when Dr Ravi was weighed against the other 2 applicants under the Malaria disease category, he received a higher score.

Ms Poonam Kandari

Ms Kandari has been working with Nirvana Foundation for the past 7 years on communicable diseases. Earlier she was working on the HIV programme in Manipur. In the context of Malaria, Poonam has been working for improving service delivery for Malaria, in Jharkhand, for the past 5 years. Her focus has been to increase awareness and access to services among marginalized and hard to reach communities, for Malaria. Ms Kandari, is aware about the problems and challenges in the area of Malaria programme and is also a skilled counselor and has also an established rapport with the community as she has been addressing and resolving issues as a bridge between the community and the programme. She has also volunteered to support community for arranging Platelets, Blood Bags, and other items required for faster recovery from Malaria, especially during the transmission season of Malaria.

In terms of eligibility Poonam, scored on the basis of the region she represents, Jharkhand, which has high Malaria burden, besides her knowledge about the disease, work experience and her ability to represent her community. Poonam's application was supported by her organization, who testified her knowledge, work experience and strong community engagement. Based on these factors, there was consensus among the EC members that she would be able to contribute to the CCM and voice the challenges in the Malaria programme.

Candidates who could not qualify

Dr Imam Ansari, from Lok Jagriti Kendra, Lohardaga, Jharkhand, had applied under the KP constituency. Although a Malaria survivor, Dr Ansari was unable to provide documentation to support his work in Malaria, although his application and supporting documents indicated his experience in different diseases including COVID but predominantly in HIV/AIDS. Further based on the information provided by him, the EC was unable to justify his ability to represent and engage his constituency as a CCM member. Hence his application was scored lower than the other candidates.

Ms Shubhangi Chandrashekhar Kharate had applied under the PLWD category. The information gathered from her application indicated good work experience, ability to represent and engage community. However she scored lower than Poonam in terms of the region, she was representing – Maharashtra, which may not have a high burden of Malaria as compared to Jharkhand.

Next steps

The minutes be documented and shared with the EC for their inputs and suggestions, prior to being submitted to the CCM for their consideration and completion of the quorum for the ICCM 2022-25.